
Pablo T. Gadenz. *Called from the Jews and from the Gentiles: Pauline Ecclesiology in Romans 9–11*. Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament 2.267. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2009. xi + 393 pp. \$157.50.

Father Gadenz (b. 1967) is a Roman Catholic priest, ordained since 1996, and Assistant Professor of Biblical Studies at the Immaculate Conception Seminary School of Theology at Seton Hall University in South Orange, New Jersey. He earned an MDiv and MA from St. Charles Borromeo Seminary, an SSL from Pontifical Biblical Institute in Rome, and an STD from Pontifical Gregorian University in Rome. This monograph slightly updates his doctoral dissertation, which he defended in June 2008.



Gadenz is not testing a thesis but instead approaches Rom 9–11 inductively. His objective is “to investigate Paul’s ecclesiology in Rom 9–11, as it is communicated through his discussion of the network of relationships between Israel and the nations” (p. 3). There are three such relationships: Jewish Christians and Gentile Christians; non-Christian Jews and Gentile Christians; and non-Christian Jews and Jewish Christians (pp. 2, 316–17). He argues that his approach to Rom 9–11 makes a distinctive contribution because he uses rhetorical analysis and appreciates how Jewish traditions of Paul’s time influence how Paul reads the OT (pp. 3–7). In particular, he concludes that the Jewish traditions Paul draws on include three themes from “restoration eschatology”: regathering the twelve tribes of Israel, saving the nations, and expecting the Davidic Messiah (pp. 6–7).

His investigation proceeds in three steps:

1. He overviews Rom 9–11 (70 pp.). Gadenz follows a common threefold division of Rom 9–11 (9:6–29; 9:30–10:21; 11:1–32) with an introduction and conclusion (9:1–5; 11:33–36).
2. He analyzes Rom 9:6–29 (51 pp.); 9:30–10:21 (31 pp.); and 11:1–32 (151 pp.), focusing most on how the “remnant” and the people of God in 9:24–29 and 11:1–32 relate to others inside and outside the church. He interprets $\pi\acute{\alpha}\varsigma$ Ἰσραήλ in Rom 11:26a as every individual Israelite Christian throughout history plus a significant number of the non-Christian Israelites who are alive at the time Christ returns (pp. 275–80).
3. He draws conclusions about Rom 9–11 in four areas: rhetorical analysis, restoration eschatology and OT background, exegesis, and ecclesiology (11 pp.).

Gadenz’s research is generally very good. He is preoccupied with the Greek text of Rom 9–11, though primarily at the level of rhetorical criticism, and he responsibly interacts with most of the significant secondary literature on Rom 9–11, including occasional references to evangelicals like Douglas J. Moo and Thomas R. Schreiner. He relies most heavily—and perhaps too heavily—on the French publications

of his *Doktorvater*, Jean-Noël Aletti. Other than calling it the *peroratio*, he virtually ignores the significance of Rom 11:33–36 (though I am probably biased because I am writing a dissertation on Paul’s use of the OT in Rom 11:34–35).

His exegesis is unconvincing at some key points. For example, he denies that Rom 9:6a (“But it is not as though the word of God has failed”) is the overarching thesis of all three chapters (pp. 9, 30–33, 83, 88). Instead, he thinks that Rom 9–11 is primarily about the implications of Israelites rejecting Jesus. So he argues that rather than being a theodicy, Rom 9–11 primarily encapsulates Paul’s ecclesiology with reference to Israelite and Gentile relationships. But that is a theme that Paul does not develop until chapter 11, so Gadenz calls chapters 9–10 “digressions” that eliminate anticipated objections before addressing the main issue.

I was hoping to observe how Gadenz’s exegesis of Rom 9:30–10:21 compares theologically with Protestants, particularly regarding righteousness, the law, works, faith, and salvation. But his exegesis of this section is selective; he qualifies, “Our interest here focuses on the contrast between ‘Israel’ and ‘nations’ described in the units at the beginning (9,30–33) and at the end (10,18–21) of the subsection” (p. 136).

Disagreements aside, Gadenz’s research is valuable for technical studies of Rom 9–11 and the various relationships between Israelites and Gentiles in the early church.

Andrew David Naselli
Trinity Evangelical Divinity School
Deerfield, Illinois, USA